Beyond War: The Relationship between Takagi Yasaka and Charles and Mary Beard

Hiroo NAKAJIMA*

INTRODUCTION

The Pacific War disrupted Japanese-American diplomatic relations as the two nations waged "war without mercy" against each other. Does it follow, then, that the war destroyed Japanese-American cultural relations? Focusing on the relationship between Takagi Yasaka (1889–1984), a founder of American Studies in Japan, and the prominent American historians Charles A. Beard (1874–1948) and his wife Mary Ritter Beard (1876–1958) that endured into the postwar years, I argue that it did not. In fact, Japanese-American cultural relations continued in spite of the war.

For Takagi, who saw similarities between the foreign policy ideals of the United States and Japan, the war between the two countries was an aberration. In his article "War Aims of America," written during the war, he proposed that Japan appeal to American idealism by working more assiduously for the emancipation of what the Japanese government called

Copyright © 2013 Hiroo Nakajima. All rights reserved. This work may be used, with this notice included, for noncommercial purposes. No copies of this work may be distributed, electronically or otherwise, in whole or in part, without permission from the author.

^{*}Associate Professor, Osaka University

"Great East Asia" and by linking the ideal with the coming new world order.³ His understanding of the war was inherited by Akira Iriye, Japanese historian who had taught for years at US universities. Irive has stressed the connection between the 1941 Atlantic Charter, heir to Wilson's Fourteen Points, and the 1943 declaration of the Great East Asia Conference advocated by the Japanese government.4 Takagi himself embodied what Iriye calls "cultural internationalism," which blossomed in the 1920s. He was an "apostle of the Nitobe sect." Nitobe Inazo, scholar, educator, and undersecretary at the League of Nations from 1920 to 1926, devoted himself to becoming "a bridge across the Pacific." He was the mentor of Tsurumi Yusuke, Maeda Tamon, and Takagi, all of whom were close acquaintances of Charles and Mary Beard. In other words, Takagi was what Tomoko Akami characterizes as a "post-League internationalist." If postwar Japan was an embodiment of Wilsonian internationalism as Iriye contends, there is continuity between the 1920s and the postwar years in Japanese-American cultural relations.⁶

On his part, Charles A. Beard staunchly criticized President Franklin D. Roosevelt, who led the nation into the war with Japan, in his *President Roosevelt and the Coming of the War, 1941*. He had been advocating an isolationist vision that he called "continentalism" since the 1930s and was very critical of the way the United States had entered World War II. It is also possible that he published such a book because, as the historian Endo Yasuo emphasizes, he had some reservations about the war with Japan, a country he had visited twice with Mary for nearly half a year altogether. Beard later recollected his experiences in Japan in his letters to the distinguished historian Merle Curti. A year after the end of the Pacific War, he wrote, "I learned a lot in Japan." Five months later, he went on to say, "I became a changed person. I have never been the same again!"

Takagi first met Beard in New York while he was studying in the United States from 1919 to 1922. On his second visit to Japan in fall 1923, Beard visited Takagi's home. During the 1930s, Takagi visited the United States twice as a delegate of the Japanese Council of the Institute of Pacific Relations (IPR). In 1933, he listened to Beard talking passionately on the prospect of the New Deal. Unsuccessful though it was, he tried to see him again in 1938. After the Pacific War ended, Charles Beard asked one of the members of the United States Education Mission to Japan that came to the country in spring 1946 to deliver a note to Takagi's associate Maeda. Two years later, Takagi wrote Beard. To Takagi's distress, however, he received a response from Mary informing him of her husband's death.

The following year, Takagi visited her. Thereafter, they corresponded frequently. He also translated *The American Spirit* that Charles and Mary had coauthored and eagerly introduced Charles Beard's later works to postwar Japan's academic community. Thus the friendship of Takagi and Charles and Mary Beard overcame the disastrous consequences of the war in Japan and the United States.

With the cultural turn in the historiography of international history, increasingly highlighting the cultural spheres of foreign and international relations for the last two decades, important works on Japanese-American cultural relations began to appear. Most of them, however, treat either the prewar or postwar years. No work fully analyzes both. Michael Auslin's 2011 book *Pacific Cosmopolitans* is a representative of the turn in the historiography of Japanese-American relations. It is an exemplary survey that covers from the nineteenth century to the present, but it is not a monographic study. Akami's Internationalizing the Pacific, the most comprehensive treatment of cultural relations surrounding the Pacific War, depicts postwar years very briefly as her major subject, the IPR, drew severe criticism from the American Right during the early Cold War, especially during the McCarthy period. John Davidann's Cultural Diplomacy in US-Japan Relations, 1919–1941 accurately portrays the failure of unofficial diplomacy, including that of Beard. Because he emphasizes cultural estrangement between the two nations, however, the remains of prewar cultural relations in the postwar years are hardly discussed. Nichi-Bei Kyōkai (The America-Japan Society)'s Mōhitotsu no Nichi-Bei kōryūshi is a very interesting book that utilizes the sources of the society, a nongovernmental organization devoted to Japanese-American friendship, and stresses continuity in twentieth-century cultural relations between the two countries. Still, it is basically a survey on the subject.⁹ Other works such as *Philanthropy and Reconciliation*, a collection of essays on the attitude of American philanthropic organizations toward Japan and their impact on the country, Takeshi Matsuda's Soft Power and Its Perils, and Tsuchiya Yuka's Shinbei Nihon no kōchiku focus on the postwar years when cultural relations between the two countries became closer. 10 In addition, biographical studies of Takagi and Charles and Mary Beard do not treat the relationship between them based on primary sources. 11 Although the Beards destroyed a substantial amount of their personal papers toward the end of their lives, I will use the Takagi Yasaka bunko [Takagi Yasaka collection] and the Charles and Mary Beard Papers among others. Thus I hope to shed new light on Japanese-American

cultural relations before and after the Pacific War by focusing on the relationship between Takagi and Charles and Mary Beard, whose careers spanned the war.

I. TAKAGI AND THE BEARDS FROM THE 1920S TO THE EARLY 1930S

Takagi first met Charles Beard in the latter's office at the New School for Social Research in New York. Beard was already one of the county's leading intellectuals and the author of the iconoclastic Economic Interpretation of the Constitution of the United States (1913) and several textbooks on American politics and history. Shortly thereafter, Beard was invited by Mayor Goto Shimpei to advise on the municipal reform of Tokyo. After Goto became mayor of Tokyo late in 1920, he instructed his son-inlaw Tsurumi, who was staying in New York, to do research on municipal reform in the United States. Tsurumi had just audited Beard's course at the New School of which Beard was a founder. Beard was then the director of the Training School for Public Service of the New York Bureau of Municipal Research after he had resigned from Columbia University in October 1917 in protest of the suppression of academic freedom at the institution in the wake of the United States' entry into World War I. Tsurumi thought Beard was the appropriate person to ask for advice. With his advice, Tsurumi did brief research and sent a report to Goto. Shortly afterward, Goto decided to invite Beard, whom he had met at a dinner hosted by The New Republic with its editor Herbert Croly in 1918. Tsurumi, who was back in Japan, sent a telegram of invitation to Beard in February 1922; Beard accepted the invitation in early March. The fact that his former student Luther Gulick, president of the New York Bureau of Municipal Research, had lived in Japan as a son of Sidney Lewis Gulick, who had spent more than a quarter century there as a missionary at the turn of the century, seemed to help Beard decide to come to the county.¹²

Beard arrived in Japan in September 1922 with Mary, his daughter Miriam, and his son William. He advised the newly founded Tokyo Bureau of Municipal Research on his first visit. He also gave lectures to public servants, experts, and college students in Tokyo and other major cities such as Osaka, Kyoto, Kobe, and Nagoya before he left the country in March 1923. Beard's assessment of the municipal reform of Tokyo was published in the United States late in the same year as *The Administration and Politics of Tokyo*. ¹³ On September 2, 1923, the day

after the Kanto earthquake, Goto became minister of home affairs, and in a few days he asked Beard to come to Japan again. In the same month, Goto also became president of the Shinsai fukkōin, the newly established government agency for recovery from the earthquake. Beard went back to Japan with Mary in early October and stayed there until mid-November. He submitted a report to Goto that laid the foundation for his recovery plan and called for fundamental changes in the city planning of Tokyo. Unfortunately, the plan encountered budgetary constraints and opposition in the Imperial Parliament. Goto had to compromise in spite of Beard's stern counsel against it, and the plan was only partially realized.¹⁴ It was during this latter stay that Charles and Mary visited Takagi's home. Mary later recalled, "How vividly I remember Charles' and my afternoon in your home."15 Then Takagi accepted the newly established chair of United States Constitution, History, and Diplomacy, the Hepburn Chair, at the College of Law (later the Faculty of Law) at the Imperial University of Tokyo. The chair was established by the donation of A. Barton Hepburn through Shibusawa Eiichi, a promoter of capitalism in Japan. Hepburn was president of Chase National Bank and a distant relation of J. Charles Hepburn, who had been in Japan from 1859 to 1892 as missionary and doctor and who is well known in Japan for creating the Hebonshiki (Hepburn system) of writing Japanese in the Roman alphabet.

Takagi was the second son of Kanda Naibu, 16 who had studied in the United States in the late 1870s and who became the founder of studies on English in Japan. After graduating from the College of Law at the Imperial University of Tokyo in 1915, Takagi studied briefly at the Graduate School of Law and then joined the Ministry of Finance in 1916. In 1918, he became professor-designate of the Hepburn Chair and left Japan in the spring of the following year to study in the United States. In the United States, J. Franklin Jameson, one of the leading Progressive historians and a classmate of Kanda's at Amherst College, helped Takagi greatly. With his advice, Takagi studied at Harvard University under Frederick Jackson Turner, graduating with a master of arts degree early in 1921. Then he studied for a year at the University of Michigan and then at the University of Chicago, also on Jameson's advice. In April 1922, he attended the International Congress of Historical Studies held in Brussels and visited English universities after that. Jameson introduced Takagi to intellectuals in England including James Bryce, the author of the classic American Commonwealth, who lectured at the summer session of the Institute of Politics at Williams College in the inaugural year of 1921.¹⁷ At the

congress, Takagi met James T. Shotwell, the foremost internationalist in the interwar years, who became his lifelong friend. Thus Takagi was truly one of the post-League internationalists. He returned from Europe to Japan in August 1923.¹⁸

Shortly afterward, Takagi became involved in the IPR, an international nongovernmental organization that provided a forum for experts on such issues as US immigration policy toward the Japanese and later the expansion of Japanese empire into China. He was an active member of the Japanese Council of the IPR (JCIPR) from the beginning. In 1933, he participated in the fifth IPR conference in Banff, Canada. It was the first IPR conference held in North America. After the conference, he visited the Beards in New Milford, Connecticut. Charles then courteously taught him "what the New Deal is" and sent his *Future Comes: A Study of the New Deal* (1933) to Takagi while he was still in the United States. The book became one of Takagi's treasured possessions.

Takagi stayed in the United States for several months after the conference. The Rockefeller Foundation invited him to conduct research on Japanese studies at American colleges in the winter of 1933–4. He traveled extensively from the East Coast to the Midwest and finally to the West Coast. While visiting colleges, he met prominent intellectuals such as Nicholas J. Spykman at Yale University, whose concept of geopolitics during World War II would become well known, and Shotwell at Columbia University, who led the United States committee that linked to the International Committee on Intellectual Cooperation of the League of Nations. Edward Carter, secretary general of the International Secretariat of the IPR, introduced Takagi to Quincy Wright, international law specialist and a founder of the field of International Relations, when he visited the University of Chicago. 20

II. TAKAGI, THE BEARDS, AND THE PACIFIC WAR

In 1934, Charles Beard published *The Idea of National Interest*, the first of his books on American foreign policy. Concerning the Immigration Act of 1924 that prohibited Japanese immigration, he wrote that it gave "great offense to the susceptibilities of the Japanese people." He continued, "There is good reason for believing that American action and methods . . . in barring immigration, were partly, if not largely, responsible for straining American-Japanese relations and driving Japan back upon a purely Asiatic policy which found expression in her Manchurian expansion in 1931 and

1932."

He also questioned "the advantage of empire" because cheap produce imported from the Philippines weakened American farmers' position in the country's economy.²¹ In the same year, he published a sequel, *The* Open Door at Home, in which he advocated a sort of planned economy so that the United States would not need foreign markets. "The Philippines cannot be 'safeguarded,' " he admonished. He also wrote: "Enforcement [of the Open Door policy toward China] means a war with Japan."²² His isolationist stance was fairly established by these two books. Two more small books followed. In 1936, Beard published *The Devil Theory of War*. a compilation of articles that had appeared in *The New Republic*. It posited a revised version of the "merchants of death" theory, based on the findings of the Senate's Nye Committee, which indicated that the military industry and international bankers had led the United States into World War I. In Giddy Minds and Foreign Quarrels (1939), excerpts of which appeared concurrently in Harper's Magazine, he warned against the United States becoming like ancient Rome or the British Empire by overextension.²³ The following year, he concisely explained his prescription for "continental Americanism" or "continentalism" in A Foreign Policy for America.²⁴

On his part, Takagi defended the 1931 Mukden Incident (Ryūjōko-jiken) and the establishment of Manchukuo in the succeeding year in concert with the Japanese government at the IPR conference in Banff. Carter was critical of this position of the JCIPR. The estrangement of the two sides might have been an omen of the war between Japan and the United States to come. As the other countries' members of the IPR became more critical of Japan after the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War in 1937, Takagi participated in a negotiation with the International Secretariat of the IPR and the organization's national councils in Princeton at the end of 1938.²⁵ After the meeting, he wrote Beard in the hope of seeing him: "I wish to express again my heartfelt gratitude for the unusual opportunity of learning about the New Deal five years ago in your home and also for the generous hospitality of your whole family."26 This time, however, he was not able to see him. Although Beard was against US involvement in East Asian affairs, he also was critical of Japanese aggression in China, especially after the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War. Sometime around 1938 when "nongovernmental envoys" advocated Japan's position in the United States, he announced that he would no longer meet with Japanese people. In the winter of 1940, Maeda, Japan's former representative at the International Labor Organization and director of the Japan Institute established in 1938

in New York, ran into Charles and Mary Beard at an apartment hotel in the city. Maeda had been deputy mayor of Tokyo under Goto and knew them well. But Charles told him that they would no longer see him. Although the incident was shocking to Maeda as well as to his close associate Takagi, Takagi would later recall that it was Beard's integrity as a scholar that had made him break off relations with the Japanese.²⁷

Takagi still hoped that war between Japan and the United States might be avoided. He attended the workshops of the foreign ministry and the navy and submitted a report on Japanese-American relations to each. He was an acquaintance of Prime Minister Konoye Fumimaro, who was two years younger than he and who had attended the same elite high schools. Gakushūin and Ichikō (First High School), at the latter of which Nitobe was principal. Thus Takagi drafted the "Konoye message" of August 28 to President Roosevelt, proposing a summit meeting between the two leaders. The Roosevelt administration did not accept the proposal. Still, he wrote two letters to Ambassador Joseph C. Grew the following fall. He explained the "true 'intention" of Japan's pursuit of the so-called New Order in East Asia and asked the United States to adopt a more conciliatory policy. "Your Excellency is virtually the sole person at the pivotal position," Takagi told Grew. His second letter to Grew was more pessimistic, and he later recalled the resignation of Konove on October 16 with "painful regret." For him, the war with the United States had to be avoided "at all costs." 28 When his student Iwanaga Kenkichirō met Takagi in January 1942, he told him that his efforts had come to nothing.

After 1943, even college students were being drafted (*Gakutoshutsujin*, Students' departure to the front). Still, he continued to give lectures as usual and published them as *Amerika* (America) five years later. Even as "Kichiku Bei-Ei" (Devilish Americans and British!) became a battle cry in Japanese society, there remained an academic atmosphere in Takagi's classroom.²⁹ In his article "America's War Aims" that appeared late in 1943, he emphasized the need to understand American democracy, pointing out the duality of idealism and realism in American foreign policy.³⁰ After spring 1945, the law faculty at the Imperial University of Tokyo attempted to contact the Japanese government. Takagi himself met with a former prime minister Konoye and Kido Kōichi, Lord Keeper of the Privy Seal, who was the closest adviser to Emperor Hirohito. Takagi thought that even if Japan accepted the Potsdam Declaration that stipulated Japan's "unconditional surrender," the emperor would be able to keep the throne. He later recalled that "the last anchorage" behind this

understanding was "the consequence of decades' study and his faith in American nationality." Right after the dropping of the atomic bomb on Hiroshima, he wrote a letter to Gen. Douglas MacArthur asking for orderly conduct of the American soldiers who would land in Japan.³¹

On the part of Charles Beard, he testified against the Lend-Lease bill, which would virtually end US neutrality in the war in Europe, before the Committee on Foreign Relations in the Senate in February 1941.³² Between the attack on Pearl Harbor until late 1942, however, Beard's criticism of the Roosevelt administration was restrained. In spring 1942, he even wrote a brief essay for the treasury department that urged Americans to buy war bonds.³³ But late in that year, the Beards published The American Spirit that included a chapter entitled "World Mission under Arms" in which they criticized "imposing civilization on other people in distant parts of the world or underwriting civilization throughout the world." They also disagreed with Henry R. Luce, publisher of *Time* and Life, who called for "the American Century." They regarded him as one of the "advocates of a militant world mission." In October 1943, Charles Beard's *Republic* appeared. He discussed presidential power in war in view of the Roosevelt administration. In the book, he saw the unrestricted executive power as problematic, which could be understood as a harbinger of his criticism of Roosevelt in the two books he penned after the war.³⁵ A year later, the Beards coauthored A Basic History of the United States, in which they criticized Roosevelt's foreign policy after the "quarantine" address of 1937 that had indirectly condemned the opening of the Sino-Japanese War by Japan. They were especially concerned about how the United States allowed Japan to make an attack on Pearl Harbor.³⁶ Takagi and others made sure that the three books were translated into Japanese after the war ended.

The Beards were critical of Japan's "ruthless militarists" who had taken over the government and precipitated war with the United States. But on the question of Pearl Harbor, Charles was also preparing to write an article. In September 1945, he published a short essay in which he hinted that "high authorities" in Washington seemed to have anticipated the Japanese attack.³⁷

III. TAKAGI AND THE BEARDS AFTER THE WAR

Maeda, one of the last Japanese to see Beard officially before the war, became the first postwar minister of education. Shortly after Maeda

resigned from the post early in 1946, he received Charles Beard's note through the United States Educational Commission to Japan in March. Maeda wrote Beard requesting the renewal of their friendship. Beard replied that it was his pleasure to renew their friendship.³⁸ Thus the relationship between the Beards and their Japanese acquaintances resumed. Charles published *American Foreign Policy in the Making, 1932–1940* in the summer of that year. The book was filled with quotations from speeches of Roosevelt and congressmen who had advocated keeping the United States out of war. There was not much analysis in the book. But those quotations themselves implied that the president and Congress had deceived the nation into entering the war.³⁹

In February 1948, Maeda, as director of the Tokyo Bureau of Municipal Research, invited Charles Beard to Japan for the third time to obtain advice on the new home rule, a product of postwar reform. Beard replied immediately: "Your kind letter of the 28th of February awakens pleasant memories of the old days, more than twenty-five years ago, when I first visited Japan, long before the great storm broke over the world. . . . I wish that it were possible for me to return to Japan." But this time, Beard, who was nearly seventy-four, declined the invitation "with heart-felt regret" because of his health. 40

Beard's last book, President Roosevelt and the Coming of the War, 1941, appeared in April 1948.41 The book, which included the chapter "Maneuvering the Japanese into Firing the First Shot," was not, however, received very favorably by the academic community in the United States. Criticizing Beard's use of innuendo, Samuel Eliot Morison, eminent historian at Harvard University, confessed that he was tempted to write, "Mr. Beard, whose favorable reception in Japan many years ago predisposed him to favor that country rather than his own in 1941."42 He accused Beard of being disloyal to the United States. The Jefferson historian Julian P. Boyd wrote Beard, "Samuel E. Morison joined the pack of wolves."43 In a letter to Beard, Charles A. Lindbergh, who had joined the isolationist America First Committee, referred to "the recent intolerance toward anything but pro-war and pro-Roosevelt administration publications."44 Now Charles Beard, who had occupied a place on the political spectrum to the left, found himself in the strange position of complimenting the "courageous" character of former Republican president Herbert Hoover, who guestioned the way Roosevelt led the nation into the war.45

As critical reviews of President Roosevelt began to appear, Takagi in

June 1948 wrote Beard for the first time in almost a decade: "Allow me to take the liberty of writing to you very suddenly after such long silence. . . . I am still the occupant of the Hepburn Chair of American Constitution, History and Diplomacy at this University, as I have been for the past 24 years." Takagi wrote Beard about a project of translating his and his wife's American Spirit, one of the sequels to their widely read The Rise of American Civilization published in 1927, into Japanese. In the letter, he also talked about the formation of the Association for American Studies, of which he was the first president: "An association for the coordination of the 'American Studies' in this country, called 'America Institute' has been organized, 46 and publishing a journal the American Review, in which I reviewed your *Basic History*, and Shigeharu Matsumoto *The Republic*."⁴⁷ The letter did not reach Beard's home until November as it needed to be approved by the Occupation authorities before being forwarded to the United States. Mary replied in the same month: "Your letter addressed to my husband, Charles A. Beard, . . . would have given him pleasure and been answered by him if he had received it before he became very ill late in July. . . . But Charles had died on September first." Still, Mary gave permission for the translation and wrote of the review as having "international value" "48

Takagi wrote back in May 1949: "I should consider it a great privilege, if I could see you once more and ask for your advice about our translation."49 In the letter, he also mentioned Matsumoto, her "old friend," of whom he was a mentor and who had admired Beard since their initial meeting during his study in the United States in 1924–27. Matsumoto was a well-known journalist with his exposé of the Xian incident of 1936, by which Chiang Kai-shek was forced to temporarily reconcile with the Chinese Communists in order to confront Japanese aggression. His first article was published in *The Nation* alongside Beard's "War with Japan" when he was in the United States. In the article, Beard contended that China was the focus of Japanese-American rivalry. It was clearly stamped on Matsumoto's memory.⁵⁰ Takagi visited Mary Beard at her home in the summer to share with her his memories of Charles. "I cannot tell you how deeply I appreciated the privilege of being at your house," he wrote after he returned home.⁵¹ The fact that both Takagi and Mary Beard had both recently lost their spouses contributed to their mutual understanding. Mary wrote Takagi about his wife: "I share your grief at her loss of a long life and your loss of her companionship."52

Thenceforth Takagi and Mary Beard corresponded frequently about

136

Charles Beard's place in the postwar American academic community, the development of American Studies in Japan, and the translations of the Beards' books. In the letter quoted above, Takagi wrote of books and the reprints of articles Mary had sent him: "I am particularly grateful, for they will help me greatly, in re-considering my attitude to political science and re-orienting my future thinking."53 In April 1950, Mary wrote about Morison's criticism and its aftermath: "Samuel Morison's attack on Beard has been followed by what is becoming almost a flood of books attempting to dispose of him. The critics are like Morison upholders or defenders of the Democratic administration."54 In the fall of that year, Takagi sent Mary the first volume of Genten Amerikashi that he called the "Documentary History of American People" in his letters to her, which was a collection of the translations of important documents with detailed notes. It would become a six-volume documentary history as the product of the first phase of the Japanese Association for American Studies. Takagi was elected honorary member of the American Historical Association in 1965 because of this effort.⁵⁵ In 1952 when the plan to found the International House of Japan was in progress, Takagi told Mary a few times in his letters about it that would become a center of intellectual exchange; it opened in Tokyo in 1955

Also in 1952, Takagi asked detailed questions about the translation of The American Spirit, and Mary sincerely tried to answer them. 56 Already in 1949, Matsumoto's translation of the first half of *The Republic* was published in Japan. His translation of the second half appeared a year later. The first volume of *The Republic* sold thirty thousand copies in Japan. The first half of the Beards' Basic History of the United States was also issued in 1949 from Iwanami shoten, which became one of the most prestigious publishing houses in postwar Japan. Matsumoto revised the translation and republished it with the original translator in 1954. He revised the original translation of the second half and published it in 1956, too. The American Spirit was also issued from Iwanami in 1954.⁵⁷ Concerning Mary herself, her Force of Women in Japanese History was translated by Kato Shizue, Japan's leading feminist activist/politician, whom she met in Japan and from whom she received the source material for the book before the war. The English edition and the translation were concurrently issued in 1953.⁵⁸ When Mary wrote of the ongoing translation in her letter to Takagi, she emphasized, "War: The most terrible thing in the world to me!"59

The effect of the reunion of Takagi and Mary Beard after the war was not limited to the reconfirmation of their personal friendship. It gave the younger generation of Japanese scholars an opportunity to inherit the legacy of the Beards. Mary wrote late in 1950, "Your friends who have been studying, in the United States, college and university education will be in New England week after next, Professor Saito writes me. I am happy that they want to come to my home." Thus Saito Makoto, Takagi's student who would succeed him in the Hepburn Chair and became the dean of American studies in Japan, and Nakaya Kenichi, who also became one of the country's leading historian of the United States, visited Mary during the group tour of the United States. Mary introduced C. Vann Woodward, one of the most influential historians of the American South, to Takagi as "one of the best thinkers in the U.S. and a genuine scholar" when he visited Japan as a lecturer at the third University of Tokyo-Stanford University American Studies Seminar in summer 1953. "I shall be proud to be the medium of his meeting you and S. Matsumoto," she continued. In the legacy of the states of the medium of his meeting you and S. Matsumoto, have continued.

Late in 1953, Howard K. Beale, professor at the University of Wisconsin, wrote Yanaihara Tadao, president of the University of Tokyo, to find someone in Japan to review the memorial volume of Beard that he had edited. He wrote: "He spent some time in Japan thirty years ago and has two or three books published in Japanese. We are most anxious to have this book of essays about him reviewed in Japan."62 Yanaihara probably knew Beale from his three-month tour of colleges in the United States in summer 1951. Yanaihara, as dean of the College of Arts and Sciences, a newly created college at the University of Tokyo, visited many colleges during his travels. 63 Beale asked Yanaihara if there was an appropriate journal to review the book. Yanaihara referred the inquiry to Takagi,64 who knew Beale and whose son was then studying American history at the University of Wisconsin. He might also have suggested that Beale ask Takagi and Matsumoto to "talk it over and make a joint decision."65 Takagi and Beale had been corresponding intimately in the postwar years. In October 1951, Beale wrote, "Last winter your student Mr. Saito came with a group of Japanese professors to the University of Wisconsin." "They were interested in area studies," he continued. Beale was "delighted to make the acquaintance of a student and friend" of Takagi. 66

Eventually, Takagi and political scientist Royama Masamichi reviewed the Festschrift. Toward the end of the review, Takagi wondered why the book barely mentioned Mary's contributions and recalled his meeting with her in his first postwar visit to the United States.⁶⁷ Takagi did not know that there was a schism between the people involved in the publication of the Festschrift and Mary concerning the "true" Charles A. Beard.

Writing about the situation of Beale's search for a publisher, the revisionist historian Harry Elmer Barns sardonically wrote Curti, "Mary is a grand old gal, but a g-d- nuisance when it comes to evaluating things written about Uncle Charley." In fact, Mary published *The Making of Charles A. Beard* a year after the publication of the memorial volume.

Another aspect of Beard and his work on which Takagi and Beale seemed to disagree was the evaluation of *The American Spirit*. Beale wrote in the Festschrift that it "was a thought-provoking undertaking, even though not entirely successful in execution." Takagi asked Beale, "Why is it that you think 'The American Spirit not entirely successful in execution' and not quite up to the level of his other works? (Mr. S. Matsumoto and I, having just had its Japanese translation out, are perhaps biased in its favor)." Beale answered as follows:

I am not certain I can justify my judgment that the *American Spirit* is not entirely successful. The concept I thought a most interesting one. It did not, however, hold my interest as most of Beard's books have at all times. It seemed somewhat tedious and not so clear-cut as Beard usually was. . . . I believe my feeling is shared by a good many others who like Beard in general, but find that volume less satisfying than his other volumes. ⁷⁰

Apart from differences in their attitudes toward Mary and their evaluations of *The American Spirit*, Takagi and Beale shared an admiration for Charles Beard. Beale wrote:

His appearance at a meeting of the Political Science Association [of which Beard was a former president] gave great satisfaction both to him [Beard] and to his friends. . . . The satisfaction arose from the fact that there had been great criticism of him because of his war books and the enthusiastic welcome he received helped to heal wounds and to sooth the feelings of people who had once admired him but had recently criticized him.⁷¹

CONCLUSION

The relationship between Takagi and the Beards continued for four decades before and after the Pacific War. From the late 1930s to 1945, their relationship was disrupted because of the Sino-Japanese War and

the Pacific War. The Beards were critical of Japanese imperialism and decided not to entertain Japanese after the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War. But Charles contacted Takagi's associate Maeda within a year of the end of the Pacific War and corresponded with Maeda thereafter. It may be a cruel irony that Mary's reply to Takagi's first postwar letter to Charles Beard reported the news of his death. Still, the date he died, September 1, 1948, was the twenty-fifth anniversary of the Kanto earthquake. Thus the date of his death is especially memorable to Beard's Japanese friends and acquaintances, because Beard had some part in Tokyo's recovery from the earthquake.

Although Takagi's wish to work with Charles Beard again did not materialize, he resumed his relationship with Mary and other associates of Beard such as Beale. Takagi introduced Beard's later works to Japan despite his declining reputation in postwar United States. Mary encouraged Takagi and his associates who were working hard to reestablish American Studies in Japan after the war. Thus the Wilsonian internationalism of the 1920s regained momentum in the postwar years, which testifies to the continuity of Japanese-American cultural relations. It is fortunate that because Takagi's relationship with the Beards resumed, Saito and Nakaya, who would train many Japanese postwar-generation Americanists, had a chance to meet and be inspired by Mary Beard. In this sense, most students of American Studies in Japan, this author included, are the intellectual descendants of Charles and Mary Beard.

Notes

This work was supported by the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science, Grantsin-Aid for Scientific Research (Kakenhi) numbers 20530133 and 24530170.

- ¹ John W. Dower, War without Mercy: Race and Power in the Pacific War (New York: Pantheon, 1986).
- ² Japanese personal names are presented in Japanese form, that is, the family name followed by the first name. Exceptions are made in the case of Japanese authors of English works.
- ³ Yasaka Takagi, "War Aims of America," *Contemporary Japan* 12 (December 1943): 1563-81. See also his unpublished manuscript prepared for circulation in the Japanese Ministry of the Navy in October 1943, "Beikoku no sensō mokuteki no kōsatsu," [An analysis of America's war aims], in *Takagi Yasaka chosakushū* [The collected works of Takagi Yasaka], 5 vols., ed. American Studies Center, University of Tokyo (Tokyo: Tokyo daigaku shuppankai, 1970–71), 2: 289–302.
- ⁴ Irie Akira [Akira Iriye], *Nichi-Bei sensō* [The Japanese-American War] (Tokyo: Chūōkōronsha, 1978), 100–102, 150–51. Iriye acknowledged Takagi's works on

Japanese-American relations in the book. Ibid., iii. See also Akira Iriye, *Power and Culture: The Japanese-American War, 1941–1945* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), 119–21. For similarities between Takagi and Iriye in the understanding of Japanese-American relations, see Tadashi Aruga, *Amerikashi gairon* [A survey of American history] (Tokyo: Tokyo daigaku shuppankai, 1987), 96.

- ⁵ Akira Iriye, *Cultural Internationalism and World Order* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997); Nakami Mari, "Taiheiyō mondai chōsakai to Nihon no chishikijin," [The Institute of Pacific Relations and Japanese intellectuals], *Shisō* 728 (February 1985): 106.
- ⁶ Tomoko Akami, *Internationalizing the Pacific: The United States, Japan, and the Institute of Pacific Relations in War and Peace, 1919–1945* (New York: Routledge, 2002), 7-8; Iriye, *Culture and Power*, 266–68.
- ⁷ Endo Yasuo, "Biādo fusai to 1920 nendai no Nihon," [The Beards and Japan in the 1920s], in *Gendai Amerikazō no saikōchiku: Seiji to bunka no gendaishi* [The reconstruction of the modern American image: A modern history of politics and culture], ed. Honma Nagayo, Kamei Shunsuke, and Shinkawa Kenzaburō (Tokyo: Tokyo daigaku shuppankai, 1990), 141–57.
- ⁸ Charles A. Beard to Merle Curti, 29 August 1946, 29 January 1947, box 4, folder 13, Merle Curti Papers, State Historical Society of Wisconsin, Madison, WI (hereafter Curti Papers).
- ⁹ Michael R. Auslin, Pacific Cosmopolitans: A Cultural History of US-Japan Relations (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2011); Akami, Internationalizing the Pacific; John David Davidann, Cultural Diplomacy in US-Japan Relations, 1919–1941 (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007); Nichi-Bei Kyōkai, ed., Mō hitotsu no Nichi-Bei kōryūshi [A different perspective on the history of Japanese-American exchange] (Tokyo: Chūōkōronshinsha, 2012).
- ¹⁰ Tadashi Yamamoto, Akira Iriye, and Makoto Iokibe, eds., *Philanthropy and* Reconciliation: Rebuilding Postwar US-Japan Relations (Tokyo: Japan Center for International Exchange, 2006); Takeshi Matsuda, Soft Power and Its Perils: US Cultural Policy in Early Postwar Japan and Permanent Dependency (Washington, DC: Woodrow Wilson Center Press, 2007); Tsuchiya Yuka, Shinbei Nihon no kōchiku: Amerika no tainichi jōhō-kyōiku seisaku to Nihon senryō [Constructing a pro-US Japan: US information and education policy and the occupation of Japan] (Tokyo: Akashi shoten, 2009). See also Victoria Lyon Bestor, "Rockefeller Blueprint for Postwar US-Japanese Cultural Relations and the Evolution of Japan's Civil Sector," in Globalization, Philanthropy, and Civil Society: Toward a New Political Culture in the Twenty-First Century, ed. Soma Hewa and Darwin H. Stapleton (New York: Springer, 2005); and Fumiko Fujita, "US Cultural Diplomacy toward Japan during the Cold War," Amerika Taiheivō kenkvū [Pacific and American Studies] 7 (2007): 62–76. Although discussing Hollywood and baseball respectively, Hiroshi Kitamura, Screening Enlightenment: Hollywood and the Cultural Reconstruction of Defeated Japan (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2010) and Sayuri Guthrie-Shimizu, Transpacific Field of Dreams: How Baseball Linked the United States and Japan in Peace and War (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012) share the same interest as expressed in this article in the quick return of American culture to Japan after the war.
- ¹¹ For Takagi's biographical background, see Saito Makoto et al. eds., *Amerika seishin wo motomete: Takagi Yasaka no shōgai* [In search of the American spirit: The life of Takagi Yasaka] (Tokyo: Tokyo daigaku shuppankai, 1985). See also Okamura Tadao, "Takagi Yasaka ni okeru Amerika to Nihon," [Takagi Yasaka's understanding of

the United States and Japan], Amerika kenkyū [American review] 13 (1979): 126–44; and Aruga Tadashi, "Takagi Yasaka ni okeru Amerika to Nihon," [Takagi Yasaka's understanding of the United States and Japan], Kirisutokyō to shogaku 19 (2003): 123-37. For the Beards, see Howard K. Beale, ed., Charles A. Beard: An Appraisal (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1954); Mary R. Beard, The Making of Charles A. Beard (New York: Exposition, 1955); Ellen Nore, Charles A. Beard: An Intellectual Biography (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1983); Barbara K. Turoff, Mary Beard as Force in History, Monograph Series 3 (Dayton: Wright State University, 1979); Nancy F. Cott, ed., A Woman Making History: Mary Ritter Beard through her Letters (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991); and Ann J. Lane, ed., Making Women's History: The Essential Mary Ritter Beard (New York: Feminist Press, 2000 [1977]). See also Bernard C. Borning, The Political and Social Thought of Charles A. Beard (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1962); Richard Hofstadter, The Progressive Historians: Turner, Beard, Harrington (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1968); Thomas C. Kennedy, Charles A. Beard and American Foreign Policy (Gainesville: University Presses of Florida, 1975); Clyde W. Barrow, More Than a Historian: The Political and Economic Thought of Charles A. Beard (New Brunswick: Transaction, 2000); and "Rekishika Chāruzu Bīado to Nihon," [The historian Charles Beard and Japan, a series of essays by Marumo Kyoko, Abe Naoya, and Kaimai Jun in 2011 issues of the quarterly Kan. My essays "Chāruzu A. Biādo to Nichi-Bei kankei: Kokusaishugi to koritsushugi," [Charles A. Beard and Japanese-American Relations: Internationalism and Isolationism], Ex Oriente 15 (2008): 119–35 and "Chiteki köryü ni miru senzen, sengo shoki Nichi-Bei kankei no danzetsu to keizoku," [The disruption and continuity of prewar and early postwar Japanese-American relations seen in intellectual exchange], in Nichi-Bei dōmeiron: Rekishi, kinō, shūhen shokoku no shiten [Essays on the Japanese-American alliance: The history, function, and perspectives of surrounding countries], ed. Takeuchi Toshitaka (Kyoto: Minerva shobō, 2011) partly discuss the relationship between Takagi and Beard.

¹² Tsurumi Yusuke, "Goto haku to Biādo hakase," [Count Goto and Dr. Beard], *Toshi mondai* 8 (June 1929): 143–56; Tsurumi Yusuke, Seiden Goto Shimpei [The biography of Goto Shimpei], 8 vols. (Tokyo: Fujiwara shoten, 2004–6 [1937–38]), 7: 506–23; Tokyo shisei chōsakai, ed., *Chāruzu A. Bīado* [Charles A. Beard] (Tokyo: Tokyo shisei chōsakai, 1958), 27–36. See also Hirobe Izumi, "Nichi-Bei yūkō no dendōsha: Shidonī Gyūrikku," [The missionary of Japanese-American friendship: Sidney Gulick], *Gaikō Forum* (January 2004): 88–91.

¹³ Charles A. Beard, *The Administration and Politics of Tokyo: A Survey and Opinions* (New York: Macmillan, 1923).

¹⁴ Tsurumi, *Biography*, 8: 216–30, 387–93.

¹⁵ Mary Ritter Beard to Takagi Yasaka, 14 November 1948, folder 659, Takagi Yasaka bunko [Takagi Yasaka collection], Center for Pacific and American Studies, University of Tokyo (hereafter Takagi bunko). Takagi Yasaka bunko is in the process of numbering folders. In the case that the folder is not numbered, the file name is indicated instead. Concerning English spelling of Takagi, he wrote his name as "Takaki" when he corresponded with the members of the IPR, and IPR documents also use "Takaki" (See Akami, *Internationalizing the Pacific*, 306, n. 44). Since, however, he wrote his name as "Takagi" in his correspondence with the Beards, "Takagi" is used in this article.

¹⁶ Takagi was adopted by his maternal grandfather when he was sixteen. Saito et al., *Amerika*, 192.

¹⁷ J. Franklin Jameson to James Bryce, 4 January 1922, Elizabeth Donnan and Leo

- F. Stock, eds., An Historian's World: Selections from the Correspondence of John Franklin Jameson (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1956), 265.
 - ¹⁸ Saito et al., *Amerika*, 26-56.
- ¹⁹ Ibid., 70–73. The report was published as *Japanese Studies in the Universities and Colleges of the United States* (Honolulu: Institute of Pacific Relations, 1935). It is included in American Studies Center, Takagi, 5: 283–355.
- ²⁰ Edward C. Carter to Quincy Wright, 11 December 1933, Sources Relating to IPR, Takagi bunko, reel 17.
- ²¹ Charles A. Beard, *The Idea of National Interest: An Analytical Study in American Foreign Policy* (New York: Macmillan, 1934), 450, 513–14.
- ²² Charles A. Beard, *The Open Door at Home: A Trial Philosophy of National Interest* (New York: Macmillan, 1934), 258, 311–13.
- ²³ Charles A. Beard, *The Devil Theory of War: An Inquiry into the Nature of History and the Possibility of Keeping Out of War* (New York: Vanguard Press, 1936); Charles A. Beard, *Giddy Minds and Foreign Quarrels* (New York: Macmillan, 1939).
- ²⁴ Charles A. Beard, *A Foreign Policy for America* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1940).
- ²⁵ Saito et al., *Amerika*, 70–71, 78–79. See also Akami, *Internationalizing the Pacific*, 194–97; and Katagiri Yasuo, *Taiyeiyō mondai chōsakai no kenkyū: Senkanki Nihon IPR no katsudō wo chūshin toshite* [A study of the Institute of Pacific Relations: The activities of the Japanese Council of the IPR in the interwar years] (Tokyo: Keiō daigaku shuppankai, 2003), 355–59.
 - ²⁶ Takagi to Charles A. Beard, 5 February 1939, folder 313, Takagi bunko.
- ²⁷ Tokyo shisei chōsakai, *Bīado*, 6–7, 59–61; Takagi Yasaka, "Maeda Tamon san no omoide," [The memory of Mr. Tamon Maeda], in *Maeda Tamon: Sono bun, sono hito* [Tamon Maeda: His writings, his personality], rep. ed., Horikiri Zenjirō (Tokyo: n.p., 1963), 167–68; Saito et al., *Amerika*, 79.
- ²⁸ Ibid., 82–88, 161–63. Takagi's letters to Grew dated 26 September and 7 October were printed in American Studies Center, *Takagi*, 5: 90–101.
- ²⁹ Iwanaga Kenkichirō, "Kaisetsu" [Commentary], in ibid., 2: 535; Saito et al., *Amerika*, 91. See also Takagi Yasaka, *Amerika* (Tokyo: Meizen shobō, 1948).
 - ³⁰ Takagi, "War Aims of America."
 - ³¹ Saito et al., *Amerika*, 93–98.
- ³² "Statement of Charles A. Beard," *Hearings before the Committee on Foreign Relations, United States Senate, on S. 275, a Bill To Promote the Defense of the United States*, 77th Cong., 1st sess., 4 February, 1941, 307–17.
 - ³³ Kennedy, *Beard*, 105–6.
- ³⁴ Charles A. Beard and Mary R. Beard, *The American Spirit: A Study of the Idea of Civilization in the United States* (New York: Macmillan, 1942), chap. 10. The quotations are from pages 550 and 574.
- Charles A. Beard, *The Republic: Conversations on Fundamentals* (New York: Viking Press, 1943), 208.
- ³⁶ Charles A. Beard and Mary R. Beard, *A Basic History of the United States* (New York: Doubleday, 1944), 469.
- ³⁷ Ibid., 467–68; Charles A. Beard, "Pearl Harbor: Challenge to the Republic," *Progressive* 9 (September 3, 1945): 1–2. See also Hofstadter, *Progressive Historians*, 342–43.
 - ³⁸ Tokyo shisei chōsakai, *Bīado*, 7, 61.
 - ³⁹ Charles A. Beard, American Foreign Policy in the Making, 1932–1940: A Study in

Responsibilities (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1946).

⁴⁰ Maeda Tamon to Charles Beard, 23 February 1948, Beard, *The Making of Beard*, 69–71. The photograph of Beard's reply to Maeda dated 7 March 1948 can be found in Tokyo shisei chōsakai, *Bīado*.

⁴¹ Charles A. Beard, *President Roosevelt and the Coming of the War, 1941: A Study in Appearances and Realities* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1948).

Samuel Eliot Morison, "Did Roosevelt Start the War? History through a Beard,"

Atlantic Monthly (August 1948), 91-97.

- ⁴³ Julian P. Boyd to Charles Beard, 23 July 1948, Charles and Mary Beard Papers, DC 572, folder 9, Roy O. West Library, DePauw University, Greencastle, IN (hereafter cited as Beard Papers).
- ⁴⁴ Charles A. Lindbergh to Charles Beard, 21 August 1948, ibid., DC 1021, folder 18a.
- ⁴⁵ See Hofstadter, *Progressive Historians*, 340–43. See also John Hoff Wilson, "Herbert Hoover's Plan for Ending the Second World War," *International History Review* 1 (January 1979): 84–102; and Haruo Iguchi, *Ayukawa Yoshisuke to keizaiteki kokusaishugi: Manshū mondai kara sengo Nichi-Bei kankei he* [Ayukawa Yoshisuke and economic internationalism: From the Manchuria problem to postwar Japanese-American relations] (Nagoya: Nagoya daigaku shuppankai, 2012), 280–81.
- ⁴⁶ Takagi used the "America Institute" and the "Association for American Studies" interchangeably. Takagi to Jewell Martin, n.d., Beard Papers, DC 1579, folder 11. The Association for American Studies, organized in 1947 and reorganized in 1967, took over a part of the activities of the Institute for American Studies at Rikkyo University, which had been originally established in 1939 as the first institute for American Studies in Japan and reestablished in 1946. The association continued publishing *Amerika bunka* (American culture) that had been issued from the institute. *Amerika bunka* was shortly succeeded by the monthly *Amerika kenkyū* (American review). See Saito et al., *Amerika*, 110.
 - ⁴⁷ Takagi to Charles Beard, 29 June 1948, Takagi bunko, folder 659.
 - ⁴⁸ Mary Beard to Takagi, 14 November 1948, ibid.
 - ⁴⁹ Takagi to Mary Beard, 16 May 1949, ibid.
- ⁵⁰ Matsumoto Shigeharu, "The New Labor Movement in Japan," *Nation* (March 25, 1923), 313; Charles A. Beard, "War with Japan: What Shall We Make Out of it?" *Nation* (March 25, 1923), 311–13. See also Matsumoto Shigeharu, *Waga kokoro no jijoden* [The autobiography of my mind](Tokyo: Kodansha, 1992), 68–70, 115–18.
 - Takagi to Mary Beard, 10 September 1949, Beard Papers, DC 1579, folder 11.
 - Mary Beard to Takagi, 14 November 1948, Takagi bunko, folder 659.
 - ⁵³ Takagi to Mary Beard, 10 September 1949, Beard Papers, DC 1579, folder 11.
 - Mary Beard to Takagi, 7 April 1950, Takagi bunko, Mary R. Beard file.
- ⁵⁵ Takagi to Mary Beard, 28 October 1950, ibid.; Takagi to Mary Beard, 27 March 1952, Beard Papers, DC 1579, folder 11. See also Saito et al., *Amerika*, 110–11.
- ⁵⁶ Takagi to Mary Beard, 27 March, 18 September 1952, Beard Papers, DC 1579, folder 11; Mary Beard to Takagi, 5 October 1952, ibid.
- ⁵⁷ Chārusu A. Bīado [Charles A. Beard], *Kyōwakoku*, trans. Matsumoto Shigeharu, 2 vols. (Tokyo: Shakai shisōshi kenkyūkai shuppanbu, 1949–50); Chārusu A. Biādo and Meari R. Biādo [Charles A. Beard and Mary R. Beard], *Amerika gasshūkokushi*, trans. Kishimura Kinjirō (Tokyo: Iwanami shoten, 1949); Chārusu A. Biādo and Meari R. Biādo, *Amerika gasshūkokushi*, trans. Kishimura Kinjirō and Matsumoto Shigeharu, 2 vols. (Tokyo: Iwanami shoten, 1954–56); C. A. Bīado and M. R. Bīado [C. A. Beard]

- and M. R. Beard], Amerika seishin no rekish, trans. Takagi Yasaka and Matsumoto Shigeharu (Tokyo: Iwanami shoten, 1954). For the figure on sales of *The Republic*, see Beale, Beard, 310, n. 17.
- 58 Mary R. Beard, The Force of Women in Japanese History (Washington, DC: Public Affairs Press, 1953); Merī R. Biādo [Mary R. Beard], Nihon joseishi, trans. Kato Shizue (Tokyo: Kawade shobō, 1953). For the relationship between Mary Beard and Japan's women activists, see Endo, "Beādo fusai." See also Cott, Woman for her relationship with Kato and the publication of the book in the United States.
 - ⁵⁹ Mary Beard to Takagi, 19 November 1951, Takagi bunko, Mary R. Beard file.
- Mary Beard to Takagi, 3 December 1950, ibid. See also Saito Makoto sensei ni kiku [Interviews with Professor Saito Makoto], American Studies in Japan, Oral History Series 28 (Tokyo: Center for American Studies, University of Tokyo, 1991), 34.
 - Mary Beard to Takagi, 6 June 1953, Beard Papers, DC 1579, folder 11.
- ⁶² Howard K. Beale to Yanaihara Tadao, 19 November 1953, Takagi bunko, Howard K. Beale file. The book is Beale, Beard.
- 63 Kamosita Shigehiko et al., eds., Yanaihara Tadao (Tokyo: Tokyo daigaku shuppankai, 2011), 305, 309. See also Yanaihara Tadao, "Amherst College hōmonki," [The memoirs of my visit to Amherst College], in Yanaihara Tadao zenshū [The complete works of Yanaihara Tadao], ed. Agei Katsumi et al., 29 vols. (Tokyo: Iwanami shoten, 1963-64), 24: 449-66.
 - ⁶⁴ Yanaihara to Takagi, 25 November 1953, Takagi bunko, Beale file.
 - 65 Beale to Takagi, 7 December 1953, ibid.
 - 66 Beale to Takagi, 11 October 1951, ibid.
- 67 Takagi Yasaka, "Bīru hen 'Chārusu A. Biādo hyōron' shōkai," [Introduction to Beale. ed., Charles A. Beard: An Appraisal], Kokka gakkai zasshi [Journal of the Association of Political and Social Sciences 68 (February 1954): 118-32; Royama Masamichi, "Chāruzu A. Bīado," [Charles A. Beard], Nenpō seijigaku [Annuals of Japanese Political Science Association (1955), 138–45.
- 68 Harry Elmer Barns to Merle Curti, 14 September, 24 October, and 29 November 1950, and 5 June 1951, Curti Papers, box 3, folder 10. Quotation is from 14 September letter. For Mary's contribution in their coauthorship, see Cott, Woman, 3–4.
- ⁶⁹ Howard K. Beale, "Charles Beard: Historian," in Beale, *Beard*, 131.
- ⁷⁰ Takagi to Beale, 21 August 1954, Takagi bunko, Beale file; Beale to Takagi, 8 November 1954, ibid.
 - ⁷¹ Beale to Takagi, 8 November 1954, ibid.
- ⁷² Saito Makoto sensei ni kiku, 34; Nakaya Kenichi sensei ni kiku [Interviews with Professor Nakaya Kenichi], American Studies in Japan, Oral History Series 4 (Tokyo: Center for American Studies, University of Tokyo, 1978), 26–27.