The Japanese Journal of American Studies, No. 17 (2006)

Men, Women, and Temperance in Meiji Japan: Engendering WCTU Activism from a Transnational Perspective

Rumi YASUTAKE*

In 1894, Kate Bushnell, a round-the-world-missionary from the World Woman's Christian Temperance Union (the World WCTU), pointed out that the efforts of other World WCTU workers who had preceded her in promoting temperance among Japanese Christians were under the management of "heathen" men, and as a result the very title of the WCTU became "a misnomer." Bushnell wrote;

> It is exceedingly difficult to make a whole convert to Christianity out of a heathen man. The truth is he would rather hold back that part of the coming of the kingdom described as the realm where "there is neither male nor female." A Japanese brother (?) professing to be a most earnest Christian said to us, "Why do you spend time with women, you have only to address the men and when they become temperance men, they go home and tell their households what they must do." How sublimely simple! To his mind, we only need to do half the amount of temperance preaching, and exalt the virtue of obedience and servility in the other half who do not hear![1]

The World WCTU was the international body of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union (the WCTU), which was organized in 1874 by American middle class Protestant churchwomen, many of whom had

---

Copyright © 2006 Rumi Yasutake. All rights reserved. This work may be used, with this notice included, for noncommercial purposes. No copies of this work may be distributed, electronically or otherwise, in whole or in part, without permission from the author.

*Professor, Konan University

been active in church-related activities, most noticeably, women's home and foreign missionary movements. The WCTU came into being in the 1870s when temperance, the most popular cause in America through the nineteenth century, captured women's zeal. Under the skilful leadership of its second president, Frances E. Willard, the WCTU mobilized a mass of grassroots churchwomen under the banner of temperance and engaged in social activism to achieve various women's causes.[2] Propelled by an evangelistic impulse, the WCTU under Willard's leadership soon set its hand to the global expansion of its movement. In 1883 the World WCTU, the international body, was established, and its organizers, mostly American women, began to travel to or reside in various corners of the world.[3] Between 1886 and 1913, there were at least twelve women with World WCTU titles who toured or lived in Japan. These were Mary C. Leavitt (visited Japan in 1886), Pandita Ramabai and Dr. Emma B. Ryder (1888), Jessie A. Ackerman (1890 and 1900), Mary A. West (1892, died in Japan), and Elizabeth W. Andrew and Kate C. Bushnell (1894), all of whom traveled through Japan for short periods of time; and Clara Parrish (worked in Japan from 1896 to 1898), Eliza Spencer-Large (1898–1901), Kara G. Smart (1902–1906); Flora E. Strout (1908–1910); and Ruth F. Davis (1909–1913), each of whom resided in Japan for a few years.[4]

Implanted in Japan, WCTU's gender-specific movement under the banner of temperance found different venues for its women's movement and temperance movement.[5] The visit of the World WCTU's first round-the-world-organizer, Mary Leavitt, to Japan in 1886 provided the impetus for establishing a few Japanese women's local unions among Japanese protégées of American missionary women. One of the local unions which resulted from Leavitt's effort was Tokyo Fujin Kyofukai (東京婦人矯風会, the Tokyo WCTU), which along with other women's unions coalesced into Japan's first voluntary women's national organization, Nihon Fujin Kyofukai (日本婦人矯風会, the Japan WCTU) in 1893. Japanese women's WCTU activism in Meiji Japan, however, placed utmost importance on the correction of sexual double standards.[6] The temperance cause, advocated by the World WCTU organizers, was left to Japanese Christian, non-Christian, and anti-Christian men, who enthusiastically led a temperance movement to support Japan's modernization and economic development.[7] Ironically, as Kate Bushnell reported, early World WCTU organizers were more successful in forming a network and spreading the temperance cause among Japanese men than women. What caused this transformation to take place? Why did

the WCTU's movement modify its "Woman's" and "Christian" nature in Meiji Japan? To find the answers to these questions, this article treats gender as one parameter of a hierarchical relationship, which was entangled with other factors such as race, class, and nation. Focusing on the activities of World WCTU organizers who visited Japan between 1886 and 1898, namely Leavitt, Ackerman, West, Bushnell, and Parrish, this article examines the transformation of the WCTU brand of temperance movement as it expanded from late nineteenth-century America to early Meiji Japan.

I TEMPERANCE IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY AMERICA AND THE WCTU

During the last quarter of the nineteenth century in the United States, women were the dominant force in promoting temperance, but public awareness of problems caused by overdrinking was first propagated by men in the early part of that century. In colonial America, temperance from excessive drinking was a respectable cause but drinking liquor constituted a part of daily life. In the early nineteenth century, however, the rapid increase in consumption of cheap distilled spirits with high alcohol content, especially among laboring men, alarmed entrepreneurs as well as the clergy. Led by men for the improvement of self, community, and the nation, the temperance movement in antebellum America significantly reduced alcohol consumption and passed, though they were not well-enforced, state prohibition laws in eleven states and two territories by the eve of the Civil War. In the process, the goal of temperance, initially abstinence from hard liquor, shifted to total abstinence from any intoxicating beverages, and its approach, originally social persuasion, took the form of legal coercion.[8]

Women participated in this effort from the beginning as fundraisers and auxiliary members of male-led temperance organizations, but soon developed a gender-specific temperance movement promoting total abstinence for the lives of women in particular. In fact, women had a special stake in temperance, as intemperate men were a real threat to their wives and families. As the Victorian ideology of separate spheres took hold, relegating women to the role of unpaid workers as a wife and a mother within the confined space of a home, women became increasingly vulnerable to men's drinking. Drunkenness turned their husbands into irresponsible breadwinners, wife beaters, and child abusers. Although

most states had passed some kind of legislation to recognize the right of married women to own property by 1850, women still had no control over their own wages and had no claim on their husbands' earnings in the 1870s. At the same time, voting and drinking were male prerogatives. While the ballot poll was the site for a male citizen to exercise his privileged duty, the saloon was the place to emancipate his masculinity from social restraint, and middle class wives and daughters were barred from both places. As the number of saloons increased rapidly in postbellum America, especially in gender-imbalanced immigrant communities, native-born middle class women could not ignore the possibility that those saloons were housing gambling and prostitution. They came to view saloons as the antithesis of the middle class Victorian home where a pure and pious wife, freed from the bread-winning task, was responsible for the moral progress of her family members.[9]

As women were subjugated to men in the male-led temperance organizations and encountered frustrating experiences, they began to form separate women's organizations as early as the 1840s. In 1852 Susan B. Anthony, an active member of the Daughters of Temperance, was forbidden to speak at a meeting of its male organization, the Sons of Temperance, because of her gender. Then, Anthony and her suffrage cohort, Elizabeth Cady Stanton, formed the first women's state temperance organization, the New York State Women's Temperance Society. Their demands for woman suffrage to pass dry laws and for liberalized divorce to free women from drunkard husbands, however, were still too radical for the majority of female temperance activists of the time. Stanton and Anthony soon left the organization to devote themselves to the suffrage movement. However, temperance and prohibition remained the causes that drew the widest support from the broad spectrum of women with different political orientations. In fact, when the male-led Anti-Saloon League of America became the most visible instigator of prohibition in the early twentieth century, prohibition rather than woman suffrage remained the cause that drew support from the largest mass of women. Consequently, women's political campaigns constituted a noticeable force for the passage of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Amendments, which respectively achieved prohibition and woman suffrage.[10]

It was the WCTU that successfully used the popular and respectable cause of temperance to shield women's social activism from public criticism and successfully turned a mass of churchwomen into a force to recreate their society in line with women's causes. The WCTU came into

being in 1874, when exhilaration stemming from woman crusaders' unprecedented success still lingered in the air. From 1873 to 1874, the Woman's Crusade of praying and marching for the closing of saloons spread through Middle-Atlantic and Midwestern local communities. Mobilizing hundreds of thousands of churchwomen, the Crusade shut down thirty thousand grogshops in their neighborhoods.[11] Encouraged by this splendid achievement, churchwomen activists, who had already been engaged in benevolent, evangelical, and reform activities, formed the WCTU, a national women's organization, under the banner of temperance. Drawing its leadership from "distinguished" women "well known in church circles," the WCTU successfully united grassroots churchwomen, who recognized their power in social activism for temperance, and grew into the largest women's organization in late nineteenth-century America.[12]

The WCTU started as a gender specific women's and Christian organization and developed into the most conspicuous women's organization in late nineteenth-century America. Importantly, the inception of the WCTU in 1874 was founded upon the bitter experiences of American churchwomen who had based their social activism in denominational churches.[13] Since the founding days of the United States, women and churches, both of which were excluded from politics, collaborated with each other in order to gain influence over the course of their new republic. In the feminization of religion by which women became the main clients and supporters of denominational churches, churchwomen stretched their assigned role and sphere by engaging in church-based social activism outside of their homes.[14] Claiming that their work was consecrated to God, women successfully protected their social activism from public accusation. By working within denominational church structures, however, these churchwomen placed their activism under not only the protection of but also the supervision of clergymen. To reduce the clergy's control, the WCTU emphasized temperance, a secular, respectable, and patriotic cause since America's colonial days, and attempted to guard women's social and political activism from public reproach. Furthermore, to transcend the gender hierarchy of denominational churches, where women were subjugated to clergymen who were divided by theological differences along denominational lines, the WCTU became an interdenominational and ecumenical women's organization. With Anne Wittenmyer, a founder of the Woman's Home Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, as its first

president, the WCTU was strongly influenced by Methodist women but drew support from women of various denominational churches. The WCTU thus became an interdenominational churchwomen's organization governed solely by women. In the WCTU, men could address meetings and were encouraged to make financial contributions as "honorary members," but they could not vote, hold office, or participate in official debates.[15]

Under the skillful leadership of Frances E. Willard, who assumed the second presidency from 1879 to 1898, the WCTU maximized the utility of temperance to expand the horizon of its movement. For the majority of its members, temperance was the cause of their movement, but Willard viewed it also as a good excuse to push her organization to achieve other women's causes. Although WCTU women had been willing to engage in the political act of petitioning for prohibitory legislation since Wittenmyer's era, they were reluctant in vocalizing a demand for woman suffrage that signaled a departure from the conventional role and sphere assigned to women. It was Willard's "manipulation" of rhetoric that transformed the radical demand for the vote as a woman's right into a "safe" and "respectable" cause for women who wanted to pursue their role as "guardian of the home." Willard adopted the phrase "home protection," that originally alluded to tariffs, to justify woman suffrage, and her call for the "Home Protection Ballot" won the endorsement of the WCTU by 1881 and gradually drew the support of its rank and file. At the same time, Willard evoked the meaning of "self-control" in her call for temperance. By advocating "White Life" for men and women, she promoted the single standard of puritanical sexual morality so that morally superior women not only gained authority to control their marital relationships at home but also were enabled to set the moral standard for their fellow American citizens. Under her "Do Everything" policy that emphasized "temperance," Willard stretched women's sphere in every direction without confronting the Victorian ideology of women's special abilities and sphere. Consequently, Willard successfully enticed the mass of churchwomen into an "army" organized under the banner of temperance and used their energy to advance women's status and to expand women's rights.[16]

Under the organizational genius of Willard, the WCTU rapidly expanded its size and network even beyond the native-born middle class churchwomen's community. Advocating that to "agitate, educate, and organize" were "the deathless watchwords of success," Willard exten-

sively traveled through the United States to attract membership by cutting across sectional, ethnic, and racial lines. Hoisting the banner of temperance, Willard resorted to not only religious but also scientific discourse in a rapidly secularizing, industrializing, and multi-culturalizing late nineteenth-century America. In addition, Willard introduced a new policy, by which a local union's representation at the national convention was based upon its paid membership and each local union was granted autonomy. This policy not only facilitated the flow of income from local unions to the national headquarters but made the organization attractive to a variety of women with different cultural and social backgrounds. During the first decade of her presidency, the WCTU quadrupled its membership and increased its national budget ten-fold. Soon separate WCTU unions were formed among black, Indian, immigrant, and foreign churchwomen, who carried out their autonomous movements under the WCTU's umbrella. Unlike many of the conventional churchwomen's activities in which native-born churchwomen's "selfless" contributions supported numerous projects located outside of their own communities—the frontier, immigrant slums, or foreign lands—to save "heathen" or less-fortunate sisters, the WCTU left a good percentage of local members' dues in each local union so that these unions could reformulate their own communities and neighborhoods for women's benefit. In this manner, the WCTU was more direct in advancing women's status.[17]

The WCTU also crossed national boundaries propelled by the same nineteenth-century American women's evangelism that also generated home and foreign missionary movements among the mass of churchwomen. As pointed out by historian Ian Tyrrell, the transnational expansion of the WCTU movement owes a great deal to the global network of Anglo-American Protestant missionaries, who spearheaded trans-cultural exchanges both within and outside of the United States. Since Wittenmyer's days, the WCTU had engaged in Anglo-American and trans-Atlantic cooperation, but Willard looked to the West and across the Pacific and accelerated this expansive trend by forming the World WCTU in 1883.[18] On her organizing tour to the American Pacific Coast, Willard visited San Francisco's Chinatown escorted by the Rev. Otis Gibson, the Superintendent of the Chinese Mission of the Methodist Episcopal Church. Witnessing opium smoking and prostitution among Asian immigrants, Willard reported:

> We there saw the opium den in all its loathsome completeness, and next door stood the house of shame. Respectable Chinese women were not allowed to accompany their husbands to California, but here were Chinese girls, one in each of many small cabins with sliding doors and windows on the street, constituting the most flagrantly flaunted temptation that we have ever witnessed.[19]

Willard interpreted the loathsome conditions in Chinatown not as "their" but as "our" problem and was inspired to extend WCTU influence across the Pacific to the world. Willard continued:

> In presence of these two object lessons, the result of occidental avarice and oriental degradation, there was borne in upon my spirit a distinct illumination resulting in this solemn vow: But for the intrusion of the sea the shores of China and the Far East would be part and parcel of our own. We are one world of tempted humanity; the mission of the White Ribbon women is to organize the motherhood of the world for the peace and purity, the protection and exaltation of its homes. . . . We must be no longer hedged about by the artificial boundaries of states and nations; we must utter as women what good and great men long ago declared as their watchword. The whole world is my parish and to do good my religion.[20]

In her presidential address at the 1883 Annual Convention in Detroit, Willard proposed the organization of the World WCTU to "belt the globe and join the East and West." In Willard's observation, "our friends" on the Pacific Coast, who had been working among Asian immigrants, were more internationally spirited and better informed than Easterners and they were "not so enlisted in temperance work" but were more willing to aid the new endeavor of the World WCTU.[21] To realize Willard's vision, Mary C. Leavitt of Boston, a divorced former schoolteacher and a national WCTU organizer who was soon to leave for the Pacific Coast, was appointed as the World WCTU's first "round-the-world missionary." By the end of 1883, Leavitt had headed west for the Pacific Coast, and in 1884 she began her westward voyage from San Francisco. Raising funds for her trip at each destination, Leavitt continued her organizing tour for eight years, visiting such places as the Sandwich Islands, Australia, New Zealand, Japan, China, Thailand, Burma, Singapore, India, Ceylon, Africa, and Europe before returning to New York in 1891.[22]

II Missionary Women, World WCTU Organizers, and Japanese women's WCTU Activism in early Meiji Japan

When the WCTU's gender-specific activism that pushed women's causes under the banner of temperance was transferred to Japan, it split into two movements: the Japanese churchwomen's movement and the Japanese men's temperance movement. One important factor contributing to this phenomenon was that the first generation of Japanese women converts under the influence of American missionaries had already determined to tackle the Japanese marriage system by the time of Leavitt's arrival. Reaching Yokohama in 1886, Leavitt stayed with American missionaries and approached Japanese women through their connections.[23] In the Tokyo-Yokohama area, Presbyterian and Reformed Church missionary women had been promoting Christian education among middle-class Japanese women since the 1870s, and it was their Japanese protégées who responded to Leavitt's call to organize a Japanese women's union in Tokyo. In fact, American missionary women, who pioneered in interacting with Japanese women in the 1870s, left a strong imprint in the minds of their Japanese protégées, and Japanese women's WCTU activism in the early Meiji era reflected this fact.

Although the gender relationship was relatively similar in Japan and the United States, the difference in the treatment of women at home loomed large in the minds of American missionary teachers. In fact, they were horrified by Japanese "*ie*" system that defined Japanese women as "borrowed wombs" and "obedient daughters-in-law." For example, while conducting a female class in Tokyo in the early 1870s, Julia Carrothers, a Presbyterian missionary wife, reported with astonishment that the Japanese language had no word for "home" but only for "house" or "place of habitation." In the Japanese house, marriage was still a matter between two houses and was contracted by the parents or go-betweens for the prosperity of the two houses. Thus, a son and a daughter married without love or even previous knowledge of each other. Furthermore, when the wife failed to bear a male child, the husband's extramarital relationship in the form of concubinage was regarded as a legitimate means to secure a male heir. From the viewpoint of American missionaries, Japanese women, who were so easily divorced and who had to endure their feudal status as well as the sexual double standard, appeared to be mere playthings of male desire and licentiousness.[24]

In the minds of American missionary women, women's status, civilization, and Christianity were intricately entangled with each other. They saw Japanese marriage customs and conjugal relationships as "heathen" and uncivilized, and endeavored to "purify" the Japanese house and "uplift" it to the condition of a "Christian home." In the minds of the U.S. missionary women of the time, the marriage bond, into which a wife and a husband entered of their own free will, was sacred and life-long. It was also the place where the more pious and pure wife gained moral authority.[25] For this purpose, they believed, Japanese women must be converted to Christianity so that they would understand the importance of purity and the sacredness of marriage. They also believed that Japanese women had to be converted to Christianity in order to become "noble consecrated women with strong will and self-control." By assisting Japanese women to know "Him as Savior" and "to have experience of His power working in them," American missionary women assumed that they could make their students "strong and assertive" in pursuing divine causes with the conviction of God's truth.[26] Their deep sense of religious mission propelled American women to engage in social activism that they believed was altruistic. At the same time, by claiming that they were conducting selfless efforts for the sake of God, American churchwomen successfully expanded women's sphere in predominantly Protestant nineteenth-century America. There, being a Christian gave women a deep sense of responsibility for social activism and a good excuse to leave their homes to engage in activities consecrated to God.

In anti-Christian early Meiji Japan, however, becoming a Christian required one to rebel against conventional society and thus Japanese women had to be "strong-willed" to convert to Christianity as well as to remain a Christian. In the early 1870s, Julia Carrothers was well aware of the trouble her students would face when "the seed sown in the girls' hearts . . . sprung up and bore fruit." Those students who sought baptism received strong opposition from their fathers, families, and relatives. Julia refrained from advising "the girls to go contrary to their fathers," but did not hide her joy in seeing them baptized since she had a conviction that she was spreading "the truth" of God.[27] Thus, under the influence of Christian missionary teachers, some Japanese women learned how to be strong-willed in their action and even to rebel against the orders of their parents, husbands, and teachers, as well as the social constraints of Japanese womanhood. The first generation of Japanese women converts were ready to challenge the Japanese system to uplift not only them-

selves but also their nation to attain a higher status in the world hierarchy of civilization.

While arousing Japanese women's feminist consciousness, however, missionary women of Presbyterian and Reformed Churches working in the Tokyo-Yokohama area fell short in providing their students with a clear model of women's social activism to change Japanese society for women's benefit. Working within the male-controlled denominational missionary enterprises, American missionary women were discouraged from ordination and preaching and were assigned only to assist clergymen who dominated "true missionary work" in Christianizing the world. Directing their extra-domestic activities in the secular realm among women and children, American missionary women sought clients in the world by crossing the boundaries of race, class, culture, and nation, but not of gender. While the feminization of Protestant churches had progressed in the United States, in early Meiji Japan where anti-Christian sentiment ran deep among the public, American churchwomen's secular efforts in promoting Christian education among women made a phenomenal success. This achievement, however, made missionary women even more cautious about not provoking male anxiety over the ever increasing presence of women in their denominational missionary enterprises. To assure the approval of clergymen for the swift progress in their projects, missionary women were reluctant to confront the male authority and the gender hierarchy. Indeed, they were extremely prudent in changing their own society for the benefit of women, and were willing to stretch but not to break the separate sphere of women.[28]

The WCTU pursued the same separate sphere strategy, but did not intend to limit their activities only among women. By successfully eliminating clergymen's control as an interdenominational women's organization hoisting the secular cause of temperance, the WCTU was ready to influence male behavior to reformulate the world in line with their vision. In the Tokyo-Yokohama area, this difference in approach between the missionary women and the World WCTU organizers became most evident over the Apostle Paul's injunction which prohibited women from talking in churches. On the one hand, Presbyterian and Reformed missionary women, who were concerned about the scrutiny of clergymen and conservatives, were reluctant to speak in public, especially to gender-mixed audiences.[29] On the other hand, World WCTU organizers freely talked to male, female, and gender-mixed audiences composed of foreign and Japanese nationals. In fact, after observing missionary

women's activities in Yokohama, Leavitt commented that their efforts to make a speech "ought to have more encouragement . . . from their missionary brethren than they (got),"[30] and she attempted to inspire Japanese women to speak in public. In one of her translated lectures, Leavitt legitimized women's speaking in public and encouraged Japanese women to raise their voices "for God and Home and Humanity." In a written message sent to the publisher of the magazine in which her lecture was printed, Leavitt argued that Providence does not require a woman to ask for male approval to use her power given by God in order to be a good wife and mother, and that she should be responsible only to God. Leavitt also insisted that if one interpreted the Bible properly there was no scripture that prohibited women from speaking in public.[31]

Importantly, Leavitt was successful in promoting social activism but not the temperance cause among Japanese churchwomen. Inspired by Leavitt's words and behavior, a group of Christian women in Tokyo organized the Tokyo WCTU in 1886. In the highly politicized era on the eve of the promulgation of the Meiji Constitution, the Tokyo WCTU commenced its activism for the elimination of geishas, concubines, and prostitutes, and its radical wing even demanded women's economic and political rights. It was the former that gathered the widest support from Japanese churchwomen. Inculcated with American Protestant missionary's views against the extramarital relationships widely-practiced by Japanese husbands, the Tokyo WCTU placed utmost importance on the correction of the sexual double standard. Tokyo WCTU members began petitioning the government to establish a legal system that criminalized not only a wife's but also a husband's extramarital affairs, to abolish the licensed system of prostitution, and to ban overseas emigration of Japanese prostitutes.[32]

Ironically, the first generation of Japanese women converts did not attach the same importance to temperance as the shield protecting women's social activism as their American sisters, although the Japan WCTU later came to work for temperance as an important cause under the guidance of World WCTU organizers who resided in Japan from the late 1890s to the early 1910s. In fact, temperance, like Christianity, could not evoke the same assurance or respect in Meiji Japan as in nineteenth-century America. Presumably, drinking was not yet considered to be such a problem when people drank rice-brewed sake that had less alcohol content than distilled spirits and Japan's industrialization process was only

just about to take place. For example, although Anglo-American missionaries and travelers in early Meiji Japan recognized the link between drinking and poverty, crime, and immorality, they reported that there was "much less drunkenness in Japan [than] in the White man's land."[33] Consequently, hoisting temperance was not so effective in guarding Japanese women's social activism from public accusation, as claiming to be "Christian" invited criticism rather than support in the socio-historical context of Japan during the early Meiji era. While embarking on social activism for women's causes modeled after the WCTU, the Tokyo WCTU, later the Japan WCTU, never made the total abstinence pledge a requirement for its membership. In fact, Tokyo WCTU members dropped the word "Temperance" as well as "Christian" from their organization's name and termed their union in Japanese, Tokyo Fujin Kyofukai (Tokyo Women's Reform Society).[34]

III WORLD WCTU ORGANIZERS, JAPANESE MEN, AND TEMPERANCE IN EARLY MEIJI JAPAN

In the place of Japanese WCTU women, who disregarded temperance in early Meiji Japan, it was Japanese progressive men who became responsible for popularizing the cause advocated by World WCTU organizers. Temperance had been introduced to Japan before Leavitt's arrival by Anglo-American government officers and missionaries who were active in the cause, as well as by Japanese students who had returned from their trips to Anglo-American nations. For example, foreign residents in Yokohama formed a temperance society in 1873 to influence sailors. In 1875, the pastor and a few members of Japanese Presbyterian Church in Yokohama formed the first Japanese temperance organization. Also in Kyoto, the Christian emphasis on temperance captured the interest of a young Buddhist student group in the 1870s.[35] However, the temperance cause preached in Christian discourse received only local and sporadic support, and failed in raising public awareness against drinking beyond the neighborhoods of these local groups.

It was Mary Leavitt who successfully planted the seed of temperance among a broad spectrum of Japanese, and other World WCTU organizers who followed her played a major role in generating a temperance movement in Meiji Japan. In the wake of Leavitt's organizing tour in 1886, people's interest in the temperance cause increased and Japan saw the inception of male-led local temperance societies. In Yokohama, the

almost extinct first Japanese temperance society was reorganized. In Sapporo, Leavitt's tour resulted in the inception of a new temperance society among Christian men in 1887. Leavitt was also well known among Buddhist temperance activists who formed a society in Kyoto in 1886.[36] This development was further facilitated by subsequent World WCTU organizers. In 1890, Jessie Ackerman contributed to the formation of a male-led temperance society in Tokyo, which also saw participation by Tokyo WCTU members. Clara Parrish, in her first year of residency in Japan, achieved the formation of the Temperance League of Japan (日本禁酒同盟), the national umbrella organization of male-led Japanese and foreign temperance societies all over Japan.[37]

One important factor that transformed the gender-specific temperance movement of the WCTU into a male-led movement is that American women were able to transcend both Japanese and American gender hierarchies in Meiji Japan. American WCTU women who advocated the principles of an advanced civilization attained at the time the status of teachers bestowed with authority and accorded respect. The unequal level in "civilization" and modernization between Japan and the United States, as well as the difference in physical size between Japanese and Americans of the time in general, invited the feminization of Japanese men in the eyes of American World WCTU travelers and the masculinization of American World WCTU women among Japanese. Consequently, American WCTU women, as teachers of modern civilization, stood on a pedestal above both Japanese men and women.[38] A perfect example is Jessie Ackerman, who wrote about her experience at a train station in Tokyo in 1890:

> Just before the train moved out, one of the young men who had spent some time in America, explained to the crowd, that it was a custom in America to send "distinguished persons" on their way with three cheers. He took off his hat, swung it high in (the) air and gave a regular "hip, hip, hurrah," in true American style, and just as the train moved out a perfect volley of cheers filled the air and I left bearing the prayers and good wishes of that enthusiastic gathering. I felt that it was worth while to come all the way to Japan just to hold those meetings in Tokio (Tokyo) and know those little people, among whom I stalked like a "giant great and tall."[39]

At the same time, American World WCTU women, who represented a women's organization, were liberated from the male control of American gender hierarchy. Thus, unlike Reformed and Presbyterian missionary

women working in Tokyo, who limited their work in the separate sphere of women and children within the male-controlled denominational missionary enterprises, American World WCTU workers could take full advantage of their status in Japan and freely approached not only women but also men and boys in advocating temperance. In fact, American World WCTU workers were ambitious in their work and interacted most closely with Japanese progressive men, who had more resources, freedom, and command of English than Japanese women. Through their lecture tours in Japan, American World WCTU women were usually accompanied by Japanese men who served as their interpreters and guides, and successfully enlisted progressive Japanese men into their temperance movement. As a result, male-led local temperance societies were created in the wake of American World WCTU women.[40]

In many cases, Japanese men who took on leadership roles in the temperance movement advocated by American World WCTU women believed in the efficacy of temperance to uplift their personal fortunes as well as Japan's position in the hierarchy of "civilization." Among them were Taro Ando and Sho Nemoto, who respectively assumed the presidency and the vice presidency of the Tokyo Temperance Society after its formation in 1890. Both Ando and Nemoto were first exposed to temperance in America in the 1880s when women were the dominant force in the movement, which may also explain their willingness to work with World WCTU organizers in promoting temperance in Meiji Japan. Taro Ando had previously served as Japan's Consulate General to the Hawaiian Islands, and had initiated a temperance movement among Japanese immigrants. He became acquainted with Jessie Ackerman in the Islands and assisted her in forming the temperance society in Tokyo.[41] Sho Nemoto came under the strong influence of Methodist Episcopal home missionaries and their temperance instruction while attending a high school in the California Bay Area in the early 1880s. After completing his university education with support from Mr. and Mrs. Frederick Billings, millionaire philanthropists dedicated to the temperance cause, Nemoto became a temperance activist. Before his return to Japan, Nemoto developed friendships with American male and female temperance workers.[42]

Another and perhaps the most important factor that explains the masculinization of the WCTU's temperance movement lies in the WCTU's strategy that aimed to generate a mass movement. Both in the

women's missionary societies of denominational churches and the WCTU, middle-class churchwomen, who were deprived of their economic, legal, and political rights, attained considerable influence by enlisting a large number of grassroots churchwomen who were willing to contribute their mites and their services. To gain acceptance among the mass, both types of organizations used religious discourse in predominantly Protestant nineteenth-century America, but did not refrain from accommodating their language to the social trends and political currents of the local region where they were situated. Arriving in Meiji Japan, where anti-Christian sentiments ran deep but where the people were eager to learn the spirit of American technological and economic development, ambitious American World WCTU workers were ready to utilize "scientific" and empirical rather than religious discourse in preaching temperance.

Through her five-month tour in Japan in 1886, Mary Leavitt quickly realized that Japan was still a "pagan land" despite its "polite culture" and "rapid progress." She came to this conclusion because of an experience she had while closing one of her "well-received" speeches on total abstinence. Leavitt wrote:

> Just at the close, I made a personal appeal to all who had not done so to accept the Christian religion, and the Savior it offers. Though many understood English, none dissented, but when the interpreter reproduced it, there was a very loud, almost savage "No" from hundreds of throats.[43]

Rather than being discouraged, Leavitt modified her lectures to be appealing to Japanese by emphasizing the scientific aspect of the temperance cause. The first Japanese groups she addressed outside of the missionary circle in the Tokyo-Yokohama area were the "Medical Society of Japan" and "a society, or club of naval surgeons and their wives,"[44] and in one of her lectures, which was translated and published in Japanese, Leavitt emphasized the hereditary nature of drinking and the illnesses caused by drinking.[45] As a consequence, Leavitt's temperance lectures were favorably welcomed by Japanese progressive men including Buddhists, who believed that temperance "would bring good health, increased production, a higher education, and a purer morality" throughout the nation.[46]

By the same token, World WCTU organizers did not miss the ardent nationalism of the Japanese public in advocating temperance. For example, Mary West, who visited Japan in 1892, emphasized the importance

of total abstinence in order to develop and advance the national interests of Japan. In Tokyo in 1892, West addressed an audience of two thousand Japanese. While referring to the Biblical figure Nehemiah as an example of a "model citizen" who rebuilt the walls around his native city to protect it from Sanballat's attack, West urged Japan to build a wall around itself of total abstinence, temperance education, and national prohibition. Condemning Japan's unequal treaties with Western nations by which Japan could not autonomously set tariffs, West spoke eloquently:

> You citizens of Japan, have also a wall to build, not the wall of seclusion, shutting you out from the world but the new wall of protection against the evils which threaten your nation. . . . I have dwelt upon the danger to your industries from the spread of the drink habit, a danger greater in Japan than else-where because your distinctive industries require such exactness of mechanical execution; of its menace to your food supply by destroying annually 4,000,000 *koku* of rice, the staff of life, here; of the burdens of taxation it imposes by increasing crime, pauperism, and insanity. . . . America did not guard against this danger and is now suffering the consequences. The great liquor interest there is almost exclusively in the hands of foreigners. . . . I fear the same will be the case in Japan if you do not now stop the vile stream which has begun to flow into your land. Existing treaties favor this nefarious traffic; while you must pay 40, 50 or even 60 percent duty to export your exquisite workmanship to lands fast learning its value and hence desiring to purchase it, the wine-makers of France or California can bring all the wine they wish into Japan for a maximum duty of 5 percent;. . . . Thus you see this temperance question is not one of secondary importance; it touches not only individual life but the well-being of the nation in its industries, its commerce, its moral and social condition, its international relations.

West reported that her lecture was "listened to (with) breathless interest and was often applauded with sounds like thunder."[47]

Consequently, Japanese progressive men became the most reliable collaborators with American World WCTU women in promoting temperance in Japan, and they claimed a role in the World WCTU's transnational temperance movement. For example, Sho Nemoto reported to the World WCTU in 1891 that Japanese temperance societies were largely organized by men and that they did the equivalent work of the WCTU in America. Presumably Bushnell's critical report on this phenomenon, which was referred to at the beginning of this article, affected the work of Clara Parrish, who arrived in Japan after Bushnell in 1894. Parrish made renewed efforts in transferring the WCTU methods of coupling

women's causes with temperance to Japanese WCTU women, but Japanese WCTU women continued to take a back seat in the temperance movement in Meiji Japan. In 1895, even after Japanese women had established their national organization, which was affiliated with the World WCTU, Nemoto referred to the Japan WCTU as "the lady's department" of their male-led temperance movement in his report to the World WCTU.[48] Like many of her predecessors, Clara Parrish worked more closely with Japanese progressive men when it comes to advocating temperance. Her effort ultimately led to the inception of the Temperance League of Japan, as mentioned above.

American World WCTU women, who transcended the Japanese as well as the American gender hierarchy, were ambitious in generating a mass temperance movement in Meiji Japan. Their pragmatism in adapting the women's and Christian nature of the WCTU temperance movement to the social currents of Meiji Japan promoted the masculinization and the secularization of their movement. Consequently, the temperance movement advocated by ambitious American World WCTU women came under the leadership of Japanese men, who recognized the urgent need for modernization and civilization for their nation in order to attain a higher status in the world hierarchy of civilization and to legitimize Japan's imperialistic expansion into neighboring Asian nations. Through the Sino-Japanese War and the Russo-Japanese War, the temperance movement in Japan became further secularized and nationalistic and took on an imperialistic tone.[49] Emphasizing the efficacy of non-smoking and non-drinking among minors to produce physically-fit soldiers, two acts to prohibit minors from smoking and drinking was introduced by Sho Nemoto, who was then a Lower House representative. Although Japan never banned the trafficking of liquor and its consumption to the extent of that in the United States, both acts passed the Diet, one in 1905 and the other in 1922.[50]

NOTES

I would like to expresses my gratitude to Konan Daigaku Sogo Kenkyujo for funding our group project on religion, morality, and science, to which this article owes greatly.

1 Kate C. Bushnell, "Itinerating in Japan," *Union Signal*, 8 November 1894.

2 Ruth Bordin, *Woman and Temperance: the Quest for Power and Liberty, 1873–1900* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1981; repr. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1990); Mary Earhart, *Frances Willard: From Prayers to Politics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1944).

[3] Frances E. Willard, *Do Everything: A Handbook for the World's White Ribboners* (Chicago: Woman's Temperance Publishing Association, 1895; repr. New York: Garland Publishing, 1987); Ian Tyrrell, *Woman's World / Woman's Empire: The Woman's Christian Temperance Union in International Perspective*, 1880–1930 (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1991).

[4] These World WCTU women were Americans except for Pandita Ramabai, an Indian educator who received strong support from Frances Willard and American churchwomen for her project of building a school for high-caste Indian widows and who visited Japan for about ten days on her way to India, and Eliza Spencer-Large, a former Canadian Methodist missionary working in Japan who was hired locally to work in Japan for the World WCTU.

[5] Besides Japanese women's social activism and male-led temperance movement, the World WCTU workers instigated WCTU causes among foreign women residents in Japan. The organization formed by foreign women residents ultimately became the Foreign Auxiliary to the Japan WCTU and worked especially for the anti-smoking cause. Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai ed., *Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai hyakunenshi* [Centennial History of the Japan WCTU] (Tokyo: Domesu shuppan, 1986), 262–265; Rumi Yasutake, *Transnational Women's Activism: The United States, Japan, and Japanese Immigrant Communities in California, 1859–1920* (New York: NYU Press, 2004), 80–83, 91–95.

[6] Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai ed., *Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai hyakunenshi*, 35–49, 93.

[7] Ernest H. Cherrington et al. eds., *Standard Encyclopedia of the Alcohol Problem*, vol. 2 (Westerville, Ohio: American Issue Publishing Co, 1924), 1384–1390.

[8] Masaru Okamoto, *Amerika kinshu undo no kiseki* [History of Temperance Movement in America] (Kyoto: Minerva shobo, 1994); Ian R. Tyrrell, *Sobering Up: From Temperance to Prohibition in Antebellum America, 1800–1860* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1979).

[9] Bordin, *Woman and Temperance*, 3–14; Kenneth D. Ross, *American Women and the Repeal of Prohibition* (New York: NYU Press, 1996), 9–33; Catherine Gilbert Murdock, *Domesticating Drink: Women, Men, and Alcohol in America, 1870–1940* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2002), 9–41.

[10] Ellen C. DuBois ed., *Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Susan B. Anthony: Correspondence, Writings, Speeches* (New York: Schocken Books, 1981), 36–43; idem, *Woman Suffrage & Women's Rights* (New York: NYU Press, 1998), 30–42; Carol Mattingly, *Well-Tempered Women: Nineteenth-Century Rhetoric* (Southern Illinois University Press, 1998), 13–38; Murdock, *Domesticating Drink*, 9–41; Bordin, *Woman and Temperance*, 34–51.

[11] Jack S. Blocker Jr., *Give To the Winds Thy Fears: The Women's Temperance Crusade, 1873–1874* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1985).

[12] While Patricia Hill argued that Protestant female foreign missionary societies, taken together, encompassed more women than the WCTU, Anne F. Scott confirmed that the WCTU was the biggest single organization of women in the late nineteenth century. See Patricia R. Hill, *The World Their Household: The American Woman's Foreign Missionary Movement and Cultural Transformation, 1870–1920* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1985), 8; Ann F. Scott, *Natural Allies: Women's Associations in American History* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1993), 213. note 41.

[13] Scott, *Natural Allies*, 85.

[14] Barbara Welter, *Dimity Convictions: The American Woman in the Nineteenth Century* (Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1976), 83–102.

[15] Bordin, *Woman and Temperance*, 34–51.
[16] Earhart, *Frances Willard*, 173–192; Bordin, *Woman and Temperance*, 117–139; Dubois, *Woman Suffrage & Women's Rights*, 30–42. Willard's legitimization of woman suffrage shifted from the protection of home (vote only for the protection of home) in 1881, to natural rights by 1892.
[17] Frances E. Willard, *Do Everything*, 35; idem, *Glimpses of Fifty Years: The Autobiography of an American Woman* (Chicago: Woman's Temperance Publication Association, 1889), 368–374; Bordin, *Woman and Temperance*, 72–94.
[18] Tyrrell, *Woman's World / Woman's Empire, 19–23*.
[19] Willard, *Do Everything*, 7–18.
[20] Ibid.
[21] Willard, *Glimpses of Fifty Years*, 430–436.
[22] Willard, *Do Everything*, 7–18.
[23] Mary C. Leavitt, "Our Round-the-World Missionary," *Union Signal*, 5 August 1886.
[24] Julia Carrothers, *The Sunrise Kingdom* (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1879), 72–74.
[25] Barbara L. Epstein, *The Politics of Domesticity: Women, Evangelism, and Temperance in Nineteenth-Century America* (Middletown, Conn.: Wesleyan University Press, 1981); Peggy Pascoe, *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West, 1874–1939* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990); Rui Kohiyama, *Amerika fujin senkyoshi: rainichi no haikei to sono eikyo* [As Our God Alone Will Lead Us: The Nineteenth-entury American Women's Foreign Mission Enterprise and Its Encounter with Meiji Japan] (Tokyo: Tokyo University Press, 1992).
[26] Paper presented by Miss. Susan A. Searle in *Proceedings of the General Conference of Protestant Missionaries in Japan Held in Tokyo, October 24–31, 1900* (Tokyo: Methodist Publishing House, 1901), 253–270.
[27] Carrothers, *The Sunrise Kingdom*, 190–191, 219–226, 234–245.
[28] There was a variation in the relationship between the general board and women's boards among different denominational churches. See for example Kohiyama, *Amerika fujin senkyoshi*; Dana L. Robert, *American Women in Mission: A Social History of Their Thought and Practice* (Macon, Ga.: Mercer University Press, 1997); Noriko Kawamura Ishii, *American Women Missionaries at Kobe College, 1873–1909: New Dimensions in Gender* (New York: Routledge, 2004); Barbara Brown Zikmund and Sally A. Dries, "Women's Work and Woman's Boards" in Barbara Brown Zikmund ed., *Hidden Histories in the United Church of Christ* (New York: United Church Press, 1987).
[29] Rumi Yasutake, "Fujin genron no jiyu: senkyoshi to WCTU to Tokyo Fujin Kyofukai [Women's Freedom of Speech: Protestant Missionaries, the Woman's Christian Temperance Union, and Japanese Church Men and Women]," *Nihon kenkyu*, no. 30 (March 2005): 133–148.
[30] Mary C. Leavitt, "Our Round-the-World Missionary," *Union Signal*, 5 August 1886.
[31] Mary C. Leavitt, "Nihon no shimai ni tsugu [To Japanese Sisters]," *Jogaku zasshi*, no. 36 (25 September 1886): 111–112; no. 37 (5 October 1886): 131–132; no. 39 (25 October 1886): 171–172.
[32] Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai ed., *Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai hyakunenshi*, 62–80.
[33] Cherrington et al. eds. *Standard Encyclopedia of the Alcohol Problem*, 1379–1382.
[34] Although Clara Parrish reported that the Japan WCTU agreed to recover the phrase "Christian" in its Japanese name in 1897, this action did not take place until 1905 when Japan WCTU's support for the Russo-Japanese War established the reputation that its social activism was acceptable and respectable to the nation.

[35] Cherrington et al. eds., *Standard Encyclopedia of the Alcohol Problem*, 1384–1391; Katsusaburo Matsumoto, *Toyo kinshu taikan* [Overview of Prohibition in the East] (Osaka: Kinki Kinshu Renmei, 1935).
[36] *Hanseikai zasshi*, (October 1890): 25.
[37] Cherrington et al. eds., *Standard Encyclopedia of the Alcohol Problem*, 1384–1391.
[38] Jane Hunter, in her study on American Protestant missionary women in China also argued that American missionary women viewed Chinese men as "effeminate," because of their physical and cultural characteristics in comparison with Americans. Hunter, *The Gospel of Gentility: American Women Missionaries in Turn-of-the-Century China* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984).
[39] Jessie Ackerman, "Our Second Round-The-World Missionary in Japan," *Union Signal*, 24 July 1890.
[40] Yasutake, *Transnational Women's Activism*, 83–88, 91–98.
[41] Ryo Yoshida, "Iminshakai to kirisutokyo: Miyama Kanichi no Hawai nihonjin imin dendo [Immigrant Society and Christianity: Kanichi Miyama's Evangelical Work among Japanese Immigrants in Hawaii]," *Kirisutokyo shakai mondai kenkyu*, no. 31 (March 1993): 141–188; Taro Ando, "Kinshuron [Prohibition Theory]," *Jogaku Zasshi*, no. 161 (11 May 1889): 49–54.
[42] Mary A. West, "Work in Japan," *Union Signal*, 29 December 1892; "Hon. Sho Nemoto," *Japan Evangelist* 7, no.10 (October 1900); *Nihon kirisutokyo rekishi daijiten* [Encyclopedia of the History of Japanese Christianity] (Tokyo: Kyobunkan, 1988), 626.
[43] Mary C. Leavitt, "Our Round-the-World Missionary," *Union Signal*, 26 August 1886.
[44] Ibid., 2 September 1886.
[45] Mary C. Leavitt, "Shudoku no iden [Heredity of Liquor Poison]," *Jogaku Zasshi*, no. 28 (5 July 1886): 257–259; no. 29 (15 July 1886): 273–274.
[46] "WCTU in Japan," *Union Signal*, 26 May 1887.
[47] Mary A. West, "Citizenship," in *Parmly Billings Leaflets for World Temperance*, no.17, ed. Sho Nemoto (Tokyo: Shueisha, 1893), 29–41.
[48] "Good News From Japan," *Union Signal*, 14 November 1895.
[49] Yasutake, *Transnational Women's Activism*, 95–103.
[50] Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai ed., *Nihon Kirisutokyo Fujin Kyofukai hyakunenshi*, 169, 395–407.